#### Journal of Alloys and Compounds 801 (2019)  $409-414$  $409-414$



Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

# Journal of Alloys and Compounds

journal homepage: <http://www.elsevier.com/locate/jalcom>

# Opto-electronic properties of Co-Zn-Ni-O films deposited by RF-sputtering at ambient-temperature



*IOURNAL OF*<br>ALLOYS AND<br>COMPOUNDS

J.C. Ford <sup>a, b</sup>, A. Zakutayev <sup>a</sup>, P.F. Ndione <sup>a</sup>, A.K. Sigdel <sup>a, c</sup>, N.E. Widjonarko <sup>a, b</sup>, P.A. Parilla <sup>a</sup>, B. Van Zeghbroeck <sup>b</sup>, J.J. Berry <sup>a</sup>, D.S. Ginley <sup>a</sup>, J.D. Perkins <sup>a, \*</sup>

<sup>a</sup> National Renewable Energy Laboratories, Golden, CO 80401, USA

<sup>b</sup> University of Colorado Boulder, Boulder, CO 80309, USA

<sup>c</sup> University of Denver, Denver, CO 80210, USA

## article info

Article history: Received 21 January 2018 Received in revised form 16 May 2019 Accepted 23 May 2019 Available online 24 May 2019

Keywords: Oxide materials Thin films Vapor deposition Electrical transport Optical properties Crystal structure

## ABSTRACT

Co-Zn-Ni-O thin films were grown on glass at ambient temperature  $(T_S < 65 °C)$  by co-sputtering from Co3O4, ZnO, and NiO targets to determine the structural and opto-electronic properties across the ternary composition space. Compositional domains with spinel, wurtzite, rock-salt, and mixed phases were observed, albeit with very weak X-ray diffraction peaks, overall suggesting the likely presence of a coexistent amorphous component. The electrical conductivity had a maximum value of  $\sim$ 35 S/cm that occurs where the optical absorption is also the strongest. The work functions range from 5.0 to 5.8 eV for all samples, but with no clear composition-based trends. Overall, it appears that the optoelectronic properties of the Co-Zn-Ni-O materials are much less sensitive to substrate temperature compared to other p-type oxide semiconductors, resulting in technologically-relevant ambient-temperature-deposited thin films.

© 2019 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY license [\(http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)).

## 1. Introduction

The crystalline mixed-cation spinels  $M_2ZnO_4$  (M = Ir, Rh, Co) are known p-type oxide semiconductors with a normal spinel structure and optical band gaps ranging from 2 to 3 eV [[1,2](#page-5-0)]. The realization in 2003 of an all-oxide p-n diode using p-type amorphous  $ZnO \cdot Rh<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>$ [\[3](#page-5-0)] demonstrated that this general class of materials could be used in opto-electronic device applications and that the materials need not be crystalline to be technologically relevant. Subsequent device application work has focused primarily on the related, and much less expensive, Co-based materials  $Co<sub>2</sub>ZnO<sub>4</sub>$  (a normal spinel) and  $Co<sub>2</sub>NiO<sub>4</sub>$  (an inverse spinel). Specifically, ambient-temperaturedeposited and usually amorphous Co-Zn-O and Co-Ni-O have been used as p-type materials in diodes [[4](#page-5-0)] and transistors [\[5,6\]](#page-5-0), and, due to their high work function  $(-5-6 \text{ eV} \mid 7]$  $(-5-6 \text{ eV} \mid 7]$ ), as hole transport layers (HTLs) for organic photovoltaics [[7,8](#page-5-0)] and dye-sensitized solar cells [[9](#page-5-0)]. In addition, crystalline  $Co<sub>2</sub>ZnO<sub>4</sub>$  [[10\]](#page-5-0) and  $Co<sub>2</sub>NiO<sub>4</sub>$  [\[11\]](#page-5-0) have been used as catalytic electrodes for the oxygen evolution reaction in photo-electrochemical splitting of water.

E-mail address: [john.perkins@nrel.gov](mailto:john.perkins@nrel.gov) (J.D. Perkins).

The application work has generally used ambient-temperaturedeposited materials; however, the material science work, to date, has largely focused on crystalline materials grown at elevated temperatures (200 $^{\circ}$ –600 $^{\circ}$ C). Beginning from the parent material  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$ , phase-pure and highly crystalline spinel  $Co<sub>3-x</sub>Zn<sub>x</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$  is easily grown by sputtering or pulsed laser deposition for all compositions between Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> (x = 0) and Co<sub>2</sub>ZnO<sub>4</sub> (x = 1) [[7,12](#page-5-0)]. Due to the nonequilibrium nature of these physical vapor deposition (PVD) methods, additional Zn beyond  $x = 1$  can be incorporated up to  $x \approx 1.6$  for films grown at T<sub>S</sub> = 300 °C [[7\]](#page-5-0). At higher temperatures, less additional Zn can be incorporated. For any given deposition temperature, the electrical conductivity of  $Co_{3-x}Zn_xO_4$  generally increases with increasing Zn incorporation up to the limit of ZnO phase separation [[7,13\]](#page-5-0) because the substitution of Zn onto an octahedral Co site is an acceptor dopant in this material [[13,14](#page-5-0)].

Similarly, for  $Co_{3-x}Ni_xO_4$ , equilibrium materials growth methods find that Ni can be incorporated up to  $Co_2NiO_4$  (x = 1) [\[15](#page-5-0)], whereas using non-equilibrium thin-film growth methods, additional Ni can be incorporated without NiO precipitation up to about  $Co<sub>1.5</sub>Ni<sub>1.5</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$  $(x = 1.5)$  [[7,15](#page-5-0)–[17\]](#page-5-0). Also, like Co-Zn-O, for Co-Ni-O, the electrical conductivity increases with increasing Ni with a maximum con- \* Corresponding author.  $\alpha = 200$  S/cm for as-grown sputtered films deposited at

0925-8388/© 2019 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY license [\(http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)).

 $T_S \approx 300 \degree C$  [[7\]](#page-5-0) and  $\sigma \approx 375$  S/cm for ambient-temperaturesputtered films that were subsequently annealed in air at 375 $\degree$ C [[17,18\]](#page-5-0). Further, for  $Co_{3-x}Ni_xO_4$ , the conductivity depends strongly on the oxygen partial pressure during film growth  $[8,17]$  $[8,17]$ .

The more general Co-Zn-Ni-O pseudo-ternary composition space has been explored using sputtering-based, high-throughput, composition-gradient combinatorial methods, albeit at a fixed  $T_S = 350$  °C and fixed  $pO_2 = 10$  mT [\[19](#page-5-0)]. Focusing on the composition-dependent trends in this ternary cation system, the highest conductivity,  $\sigma \approx 100$  S/cm, occurs in an area centered at Co2NiO4, but the best combination of high conductivity and low optical absorption occurs closer to  $Co<sub>1.7</sub>Ni<sub>0.8</sub>Zn<sub>0.5</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$  [\[19\]](#page-5-0), a composition that would be difficult to guess from the prior pseudobinary Co-Zn-O and Co-Ni-O studies. However, no similar materials information is currently available for pseudo-ternary Co-Zn-Ni-O films deposited at ambient temperature, which, as discussed above, are more commonly used for applications  $[4-8]$  $[4-8]$  $[4-8]$  $[4-8]$  $[4-8]$ .

To address this lack of more application-relevant materials data, Co-Zn-Ni-O thin films were deposited onto ambient-temperature glass substrates by RF sputtering with  $pO<sub>2</sub> = 10$  mT. Three sputter sources (ZnO, NiO, and  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$ ) were used in an off-axis co-sputtering configuration to create combinatorial libraries with intentional compositional gradients. The crystal structure, conductivity, transparency, and work function were measured as a function of the measured composition across the majority of the pseudoternary composition space. For the ambient-temperaturedeposited Co-Zn-Ni-O films, the conductivity ranged from 0.004 to 35 S/cm and the optical absorption coefficient ( $\alpha$ ) at  $\hbar \omega = 1.8 \text{ eV}$  $(\lambda = 700 \text{ nm})$  ranged from  $1 \times 10^4$  to  $2 \times 10^5 \text{ cm}^{-1}$ . Additionally, for all compositions, the Kelvin-probe-measured work function  $(\phi)$  lay between 5.0 and 5.8 eV, but there were no clear trends with composition. The maximum conductivity and maximum optical absorption both occur in a narrow composition region on the  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$ –NiO tie line between  $Co<sub>2</sub>NiO<sub>4</sub>$  and NiO, where the films are the least crystalline. All of the data for this study, including deposition details, is available through the NREL High Throughput Experimental Materials Database (HTEM DB, <https://htem.nrel.gov> see Supplemental Information for details) [\[22\]](#page-5-0) with the exception of the two grazing incidence x-ray diffraction (XRD) measurements.

Overall, the optical absorption and work function for these ambient-temperature-deposited Co-Zn-Ni-O films are similar to those for films grown at 350 $\degree$ C [\[19](#page-5-0)]. However, the maximum conductivity decreases by a factor of three from  $\sigma = 110$  S/cm for  $T_S = 350$  °C to  $\sigma = 35$  S/cm for the films grown at ambient temperature, with all other parameters the same [\[19](#page-5-0)]. We note that this decrease in conductivity is much smaller than the factor of  $10<sup>3</sup>$ observed for p-type delafossite (CuAlO<sub>2</sub> family) thin films [[20,21](#page-5-0)]. This relative deposition-temperature insensitivity of the electrical conductivity in Co-Zn-Ni-O materials may be because the lowenergy cation anti-site defects in  $Co<sub>2</sub>ZnO<sub>4</sub>$  and similar spinels are not detrimental, but rather, are actually net acceptor doping defects [[13,14\]](#page-5-0). Accordingly, we find that ambient-temperature-deposited Co-Zn-Ni-O thin-film materials have promising opto-electronic properties for device applications provided that high transparency is not need or that very thin layers can be used, such as for HTLs.

#### 2. Experimental methods

The Co-Zn-Ni-O films were grown by co-sputtering in a 1:1 O2:Ar mixture at 20 mTorr total pressure using RF power. A base pressure of  $2.1 \times 10^{-6}$  Torr or lower was achieved before all depositions. All depositions were conducted at ambient temperatures and the measured substrate temperature, which increased due to plasma heating, did not exceed 65 °C. All films were deposited onto  $2'' \times 2''$  Corning Eagle 2000 glass substrates that were ultrasonically cleaned sequentially in acetone and IPA for 15 min followed by a 5-min  $O<sub>2</sub>$  plasma reactive-ion etch prior to film deposition. Three 2"-diameter sputter magnetrons (Angstrom Sciences) were positioned off center and oriented at an angle to the substrate to yield intentional two-dimensional composition gradients across each  $2<sup>0</sup>$  2<sup> $<sup>0</sup>$ </sup> sample library. The deposition details for the 17 libraries used</sup> in this work are provided in Table S1 of the Supplemental Information. All material property measurements (except for Kelvin probe measurements) were taken on the same 44-point grid so that the measurements could be compared directly.

The film composition was measured with a Matrix Metrologies MaXXi 5 PIN x-ray fluorescence (XRF) system with a tungsten anode,  $800$ - $\mu$ m collimator, and  $300-450$ -s measurement times. The obtained spectra were analyzed with MTF-FP software to yield cation ratios and film thickness. The XRF-based thickness measurements were calibrated by direct profilometer (Dektak 8) measurements of a reference Zn-Ni-Co-O sample grown at the same conditions. The XRD mapping measurements were performed with a Bruker AXS D8 Discover 8- axis system with a Cu  $K_{\alpha}$  source and a two-dimensional detector using integration times of  $300-450$  s. The grazing incidence XRD measurements were performed with a Rigaku DMAX diffractometer with a Cu  $K_{\alpha}$  source and a point detector.

The optical transmission and reflection spectra were measured from 300 to 1000 nm with an Ocean Optics CCD array spectrometer coupled to a home-built fiber-optic-based mapping system with a combined deuterium plasma and tungsten-filament light source. The optical absorption coefficient was calculated from the measured transmittance (T), reflectance (R), and film thickness (d) using:

$$
\alpha = -\frac{1}{d} \ln \left( \frac{T}{1 - R} \right) \tag{1}
$$

The sheet resistance (Rs) was measured with a standard colinear four-point-probe technique using a current of  $1 \mu A$ . The work-function measurements were made using a scanning Kelvin probe (KP Technologies SKP 450) on a 440-point grid and then spatially averaged to match the 44-point grid used for all other measurements. The samples were kept in air for up to three weeks before the Kelvin probe measurements.

## 3. Results

#### 3.1. Crystal structure

The representative XRD patterns in Fig.  $1(a)$  show the main phases and some of the mixed phases that were measured across the Co-Zn-Ni-O materials. Representative measured patterns--which include wurtzite (WZ), rock-salt (RS), spinel (SP), and mixed  $RS + SP$  —are shown using different colors. Note that measured patterns are normalized by film thickness and integration time to allow a fair comparison of their respective intensities. [Fig. 1](#page-2-0)(b) shows reference patterns for spinel, rock-salt, and wurtzite crystal structures from the simulated ICDD powder diffraction patterns of  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$ , NiO, and ZnO. In one composition region, the background subtracted patterns analyzed here showed no observable crystalline scattering. A representative pattern for this region is shown here in black and labelled 'No detected phase'. The specific composition locations for the five representative XRD patterns are shown in the inset as well as by square markers in [Fig. 2.](#page-2-0)

Notably, the intensity of the XRD peaks for these ambienttemperature-deposited films is much lower than that measured in Ref. [\[19](#page-5-0)] for compositionally comparable films grown at

<span id="page-2-0"></span>

Fig. 1. (a) Representative measured XRD patterns from the different detectable phases observed. (b) Calculated reference spectra for the different structures from the ICDD database.  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$  (PDF card 00-042-1467), NiO (PDF card 00-044-1159), and ZnO (PDF card 00-036-1451).



Fig. 2. Regions of different detected phases found in the Co-Zn-Ni-O material system. Overlaid square symbols squares denote the points for the representative XRD patterns displayed in Fig. 1. The solid black line is the phase boundary between the spinel and mixed rock-salt/spinel region for films deposited at  $350\,^{\circ}$ C [\[19](#page-5-0)]. The known crystalline phases are labelled:  $(SP) = Spinel$ ,  $(WZ) = Wurtzite$ , and  $(RS) = Rock-salt$ .

 $T<sub>S</sub> = 350$  °C. The peaks are also relatively broad, indicating small grain sizes, crystalline disorder, or nonuniform strain for the crystallites in the films. Overall, the distinct lack of strong XRD peaks suggests that the observed crystalline phases are likely mixed with a substantial amorphous or nano-crystalline component. We note that the automated background subtraction process used for these high-throughput mapping measurements to remove the scattering from the amorphous glass substrate will also remove any amorphous scattering arising from the film. Hence, we cannot quantify an amorphous component. Representative as-measured and background subtracted spectra are shown in Fig. S1 of the Supplemental Information.

The composition regions for the different structures are shown in Fig. 2. Samples that did not have detectable peaks using our laboratory-scale XRD instrument are indicated as 'None'. We emphasize that Fig. 2 is not a phase diagram, but rather, only a map of observed detectable phases. As discussed above, given the weak scattering and broad peaks, it is likely the films are mixed phase with an amorphous or nano-crystalline component present in addition to the observed phase for most, if not all, compositions.

Near the vertices of Fig. 2, the samples show the expected crystalline structure. A large area of the composition space extending away from the  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$  corner has a spinel structure (yellow markers). In the center of the ternary phase space, the separation of spinel and rock-salt-type crystal structures occurs for Co percentages smaller than  $40\% - 55\%$ , as shown in Fig. 2. Mixed rock-salt and spinel structures are present below these Co cation percentages (orange markers). Along the  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$ -ZnO tie line, the observed structure goes with increasing Zn content from spinel to rock-salt to wurtzite with mixed-phase regions in between. The rock-salt phase is observed on the  $ZnO-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$  tie line for Zn percentages from 61% to 66%.

Along the  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$ -NiO tie line, a no-phases-observed region (no detectable XRD peaks in high-throughput mapping measurements) is observed for Co concentrations between 24% and 57%. Here, it is likely that structural frustration between the spinel  $(Co_2NiO_4)$  and rock-salt (NiO) phases leads to the formation of this poorly crystalline region for films grown at low (ambient) temperatures [\[23,24](#page-5-0)]. This observed region extends only slightly (~6% Zn concentration) into the center of the phase diagram.

Of the representative XRD patterns shown in Fig. 1, those for the spinel region (yellow) and the no-phases region (black) are the hardest to assign a structure, given the very low signal level obtained for the high-throughput mapping measurements with which this data was collected. Accordingly, to better assess the crystalline structure of these regions, we performed grazing incidence ( $\omega = 0.425^{\circ}$ ) x-ray diffraction measurements (GIXRD) for a library representative of each of these regions. The measured patterns shown in [Fig. 3](#page-3-0) have clearly observable peaks corresponding to the spinel structure. Due to the substantial spot size broadening inherent to grazing incidence measurements, these two measurements each cover many mapping sample spots shown in Fig. 2, and hence are representative of a region rather than a single composition. Nevertheless, these GIXRD measurements both confirm the observation of a spinel structure in the 'spinel' region of Fig. 2 and demonstrate that the 'no-phases-observed' region is not really amorphous.

## 3.2. Optoelectronic properties

The conductivity values (calculated from the sheet resistance and thickness measurements) are shown in [Fig. 4](#page-3-0), plotted versus the ternary composition space. The electrical conductivity generally increases with decreasing Zn content. The lowest conductivities  $(\sigma \approx 4.2 \times 10^{-3} \text{ S/cm})$  are on the ZnO–Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> binary tie line with high Zn concentrations. The maximum conductivity ( $\sigma \approx 35$  S/cm) occurs on the Zn-free edge of the ternary composition diagram with Co percentages between 30% and 50% along the  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$ –NiO tie line. We note that there is substantial spread in the measured

<span id="page-3-0"></span>

Fig. 3. Measured grazing incidence x-ray diffraction (GIXRD) patterns for represen-tative spots in the Spinel and No-phases-observed regions [Fig. 2](#page-2-0).  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$  spinel (blue) and NiO rock salt (green) reference patterns are shown for comparison. The inset shows the central composition of the measured spots.



Fig. 4. Electrical conductivity ( $\sigma$ ) as a function of metal composition for ambienttemperature depositions. (Inset) Conductivity as a function of composition for depositions at 350 $\degree$ C [\[19](#page-5-0)].

conductivity (color variation in Fig. 4) for compositionally similar samples. Electrical conductivity is very sensitive to small changes in defect concentrations and film morphology with the measured variations in electrical conductivity likely occurring due to the different synthesis conditions used for libraries with compositional overlap. Accordingly, for any given compositional region, the higher conductivity values can be taken as a representative upper bound on the conductivity achievable at ambient temperature in our deposition system.

Optical transmission spectra for four representative films are shown in Fig. 5 with the cation composition for each plotted in the inset. The Zn-rich film  $(Zn_{0.88}Co_{0.12}O_y)$  which is close to the ZnO corner is ~80% transparent for  $\lambda$  > 700 nm and shows a semiconductor-like increase in absorption for shorter wavelengths. In contrast, the other three spectra shown all have a low



Fig. 5. Optical transmission vs. wavelength spectra for Co-Zn-Ni-O films with different compositions. (Inset) Shows the location in compositional space of the four transmission spectra.

transmission across the entire visible spectrum, with no clear onset of absorption. This includes Spectrum 2, which indicates a ternarycation film with detectable spinel XRD peaks (see [Figs. 1 and 2\)](#page-2-0), as well as Spectrum 3 for a no-phases-observed film from the highestconductivity region and Spectrum 4 that has a composition very close to  $Co<sub>2</sub>NiO<sub>4</sub>$ .

To provide a thickness-independent view of the optical properties, Fig. 6 shows the absorption coefficient at  $\lambda = 700$  nm<br>(h $\omega = 1.8$  eV). The minimum absorption coefficient,  $(h\omega = 1.8 \text{ eV})$ . The minimum absorption coefficient,  $\alpha = 5.7 \times 10^3 \text{ cm}^{-1}$ , occurs at Zn<sub>0.86</sub>Co<sub>0.14</sub>O<sub>y</sub>, which is close to the ZnO vertex. The maximum value,  $\alpha = 2.0 \times 10^5 \text{ cm}^{-1}$ , occurs at  $Co<sub>0.33</sub>Ni<sub>0.67</sub>O<sub>v</sub>$ . Notably, the highest absorption occurs in the same region that has the highest electrical conductivity (Fig. 4) and the lowest crystallinity ([Fig. 2](#page-2-0)). The absorption for other wavelengths in the visible spectrum shows the same general trend—namely, that the absorption coefficient decreases for compositions with higher zinc percentages.



Fig. 6. Absorption coefficient ( $\alpha$ ) at  $\lambda = 700$  nm vs. metal composition for ambienttemperature depositions. (Inset) Absorption coefficient for depositions at  $350^{\circ}$ C sub-strate temperature [[19](#page-5-0)]. The dashed line is the tie line between  $Co_2ZnO_4$  and  $CoNi_2O_4$ .

For all films, the work function (see Fig. S2 in Supplemental Information) lies within the range of  $5.0-5.8$  eV. However, no clear trends with composition, crystal structure, or conductivity were observed. We note that the work-function measurements were done in air using a Kelvin probe on samples with no special surface treatment. Consequentially, the observed  $\pm$ 0.4 V variance may arise largely from spot-to-spot differences in the surface condition.

## 4. Discussion

Overall, the intensity of the XRD peaks measured for the ambient-temperature-deposited Co-Zn-Ni-O were much weaker than those measured for films grown at 350 °C [[19\]](#page-5-0), suggesting that there is likely a substantial non-crystalline or weakly crystalline component to these films. However, the composition region where a spinel structure was observed was very similar for both the films grown at ambient temperature and those grown at  $350^{\circ}$ C. To make this clear, the spinel region boundary for films grown at  $T_S = 350$  °C from Ref. [\[19](#page-5-0)] is shown with a solid black line in [Fig. 2](#page-2-0). Additionally, for the ambient-temperature-deposited films, a least crystalline region with no detectable XRD peaks in high-throughput mapping measurements occurs along the  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$ -NiO tie line between the crystalline spinel  $Co<sub>2</sub>NiO<sub>4</sub>$  and rock-salt NiO phases. As discussed above, the GIXRD measurement ([Fig. 3\)](#page-3-0) of this region shows the presence of at least some spinel component material, albeit with very broad and weak GIXRD peaks.

For the ambient-temperature-deposited Co-Zn-Ni-O films studied here, the maximum conductivity is 35 S/cm, which is a factor of three less than the 110 S/cm reported in Ref. [[19\]](#page-5-0) for films grown in the same deposition system but at  $T_s = 350$  °C. Additionally, the region of highest conductivity shifted along the  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$ -NiO binary tie line from  $Co<sub>2</sub>NiO<sub>4</sub>$  (67% Co) for samples grown at  $T_s = 350$  °C to a region along the Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>–NiO tie line with Co percentages from 30% to 50%. Higher conductivities of  $\sigma = 204$  S/ cm at composition Co<sub>2</sub>NiO<sub>4</sub> [\[19](#page-5-0)] and  $\sigma = 350$  S/cm at composition  $Co<sub>1.5</sub>Ni<sub>1.5</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$  [\[17\]](#page-5-0) have been reported; but in both cases, the films were annealed in air at temperatures of  $375^{\circ}$ C or higher after deposition. In both these cases and others [[16\]](#page-5-0), a general region of higher conductivity is observed along the  $Co<sub>3</sub>NiO<sub>4</sub>$ –NiO tie line for compositions Ni-rich relative to  $Co<sub>2</sub>NiO<sub>4</sub>$  up to the point where NiO precipitation is observed. In this work on ambient-temperaturedeposited films, we also observe increasing conductivity with increasing Ni content along the  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$ -NiO tie line up to the point where NiO is observed.

Interestingly, for the ambient-temperature-deposited Co-Zn-Ni-O films studied here, the compositions with highest conductivity are also those that are the least crystalline. At this time, the specific hole-doping mechanism for these ambient-temperature-deposited materials is not known. However, we note that for crystalline Co-Ni-O, the electrical conductivity is known to depend strongly on the oxygen partial pressure during growth  $[8,17]$  $[8,17]$ . This suggests that the electrical conductivity of nano-crystalline or amorphous Co-Ni-O may be controlled by oxygen stoichiometry—as it is in n-type amorphous In-Zn-O, where the conductivity, which remains high across the compositionally broad region and is relatively independent of cation composition, but depends strongly on the oxygen partial pressure during deposition [[25](#page-5-0)]. Note that here we have focused on the effects of cation composition using only one oxygen partial pressure ( $pO<sub>2</sub> = 10$  mT) during deposition.

For a p-type oxide semiconductor, the relatively high conductivity of the Co-Zn-Ni-O films when deposited at ambient temperature is a substantial benefit for device applications [[4,5,8,9,19\]](#page-5-0). This resilience of the conductivity at low deposition temperatures for the Co-Zn-Ni-O material system strongly contrasts with that observed for p-type delafossites typified by  $CuAlO<sub>2</sub>$  and  $CuCrO<sub>2</sub>$ :Mg. CuAlO<sub>2</sub> has a low conductivity ( $\sigma \approx 10^{-4}$  S/cm) when deposited by RF sputtering at 500 $^{\circ}$ C, and only after annealing at 900 $^{\circ}$ C does the conductivity increase to  $\sigma \approx 0.1$  S/cm [\[20\]](#page-5-0). For CuCrO<sub>2</sub>:Mg films grown by PLD, the conductivity of the films was maximized  $(\sigma \approx 3 \text{ S/cm})$  at a deposition temperature of 500 °C and dropped to its lowest value ( $\sigma \approx 0.002$  S/cm) when the substrate was kept at room temperature  $[21]$ . For reference, the highest conductivity obtained for thin films of CuCrO<sub>2</sub>:Mg is  $\sigma \approx 220$  S/cm and was obtained by RF sputtering at 600 °C [\[26\]](#page-5-0); but no data are provided for the conductivity of CuCrO2:Mg films sputtered at ambient temperature.

The absorption coefficients for the ambient-temperature-grown Co-Zn-Ni-O are similar in magnitude to those reported for films grown at T<sub>S</sub> = 350 °C [[19\]](#page-5-0) with  $\alpha \approx 1 \times 10^5$  to  $4 \times 10^5$  cm<sup>-1</sup> at  $\lambda = 700$  nm. The high-temperature study was able to correlate changes in the absorption coefficient based on composition of the films. With a visible absorption coefficient in the  $10^5$  cm<sup>-1</sup> range, these films are too absorbing to be used as conventional transparent contacts. However, their p-type conduction allows their use in diodes [[4\]](#page-5-0) and transistors [[5](#page-5-0)] as well as for thin HTLs because they also have a high work function ( $\phi = 5.4 \pm 0.4$  V) [[8,9,19](#page-5-0)].

For the crystalline Co-Zn-Ni-O films grown at  $350^{\circ}$ C, there is an abrupt, compositionally dependent, crossover from low absorption to strong absorption in going from the low-Co to high-Co side of the  $Co<sub>2</sub>ZnO<sub>4</sub>$ -CoNi<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> tie line ([Fig. 6](#page-3-0) inset), which is attributed to optical transitions between the Co atoms in octahedral and tetrahedral positions [\[19](#page-5-0)]. No such clear, compositionally dependent changes in the absorption coefficient are observed for the ambienttemperature-deposited Co-Zn-Ni-O films. Rather, there is a gradual general increase in absorption coefficient with decreasing Zn content. Comparing the compositional trends for electrical conductivity [\(Fig. 4\)](#page-3-0) and optical absorption coefficient ([Fig. 6](#page-3-0)) across the full ternary composition space, there is a remarkable similarity in the overall color-scale variation, which indicates a general correlation between increasing conductivity and increasing absorption, as shown explicitly in Fig. S3 of the Supplemental Information. Further, because the conductivity is displayed with a logarithmic color scale and absorption is exponential in the absorption coefficient, there is likely to be a relatively direct correlation between sheet conductance and optical absorption in these materials.

### 5. Conclusions

The broad compositional dependence of the optical, electrical, and structural properties of Co-Zn-Ni-O films deposited by RF sputtering on glass at ambient temperature was investigated using high-throughput combinatorial experiments. Overall, compared to similar films grown at 350 $\degree$ C, the Co-Zn-Ni-O films deposited at ambient temperature were found to: 1) be much less crystalline; 2) have a lower conductivity, with maximum conductivity being ~35 S/ cm, a factor of 3 decrease; 3) have a similar-magnitude optical absorption coefficient; and 4) have a similar, and large, work function  $(\phi = 5.4 \pm 0.4 V)$ . Notably different for the ambient-temperaturedeposited films is a nearly-amorphous region observed along the  $Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$ –NiO tie line, which is also where the electrical conductivity is highest and optical absorption strongest. Compared to other p-type oxide semiconductors, the electrical conductivity of the Co-Zn-Ni-O materials depends much less on substrate temperature, resulting in ambient-temperature-deposited films with high enough conductivity to be technologically relevant.

#### Acknowledgements

This work was authored in part by the National Renewable Energy Laboratory, operated by Alliance for Sustainable Energy, <span id="page-5-0"></span>LLC, for the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE) under Contract No. DE-AC36-08GO23808. This work was conducted as part of the Center for Inverse Design (CID) and the Center for Next Generation of Materials Design (CNGMD) Energy Frontier Research Centers funded by U.S. DOE, Office of Science, Basic Energy Sciences. The views expressed in the article do not necessarily represent the views of the DOE or the U.S. Government.

### Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2019.05.275>.

#### References

- [1] [H. Mizoguchi, M. Hirano, S. Fujitsu, T. Takeuchi, K. Ueda, H. Hosono, ZnRh2O4:](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref1) [a p-type semiconducting oxide with a valence band composed of a low spin](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref1) [state of Rh3](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref1)+ in a 4d6 confi[guration, Appl. Phys. Lett. 80 \(2002\) 1207](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref1)-[1209](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref1).
- [2] M. Dekkers, G. Rijnders, D.H.A. Blank, ZnIr<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub>, a p-type transparent oxide [semiconductor in the class of spinel zinc-d6-transition metal oxide, Appl.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref2) Phys. Lett. 90 (2007)
- [3] [S. Narushima, H. Mizoguchi, K.I. Shimizu, K. Ueda, H. Ohta, M. Hirano,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref3) [T. Kamiya, H. Hosono, A p-type amorphous oxide semiconductor and room](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref3) [temperature fabrication of amorphous oxide p-n heterojunction diodes, Adv.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref3) [Mater. 15 \(2003\) 1409](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref3)-[1413.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref3)
- [4] [F.L. Schein, M. Winter, T. B](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref4)ö[ntgen, H. Von Wenckstern, M. Grundmann, Highly](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref4) [rectifying p-ZnCo2O4/n-ZnO heterojunction diodes, Appl. Phys. Lett. 104](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref4) [\(2014\).](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref4)
- [5] [F.-L. Schein, H. von Wenckstern, H. Frenzel, M. Grundmann, ZnO-based n](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref5)channel junction fi[eld-effect transistor with room-temperature-fabricated](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref5) [amorphous p-type ZnCo2O4 gate, IEEE Electron. Device Lett. 33 \(2012\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref5) [676](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref5)-[678](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref5).
- [6] [F.J. Kluepfel, F.-L. Schein, M. Lorenz, H. Frenzel, H. von Wenckstern,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref6) [M. Grundmann, Comparison of ZnO-based JFET, MESFET, and MISFET, IEEE](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref6) Trans. Electron Devices 60 (2013)  $1828 - 1833$  $1828 - 1833$ .
- [7] [A. Zakutayev, T.R. Paudel, P.F. Ndione, J.D. Perkins, S. Lany, A. Zunger,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref7) [D.S. Ginley, Cation off-stoichiometry leads to high p-type conductivity and](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref7) [enhanced transparency in Co2ZnO4 and Co2NiO4 thin](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref7) films, Phys. Rev. B 85 [\(2012\), 085204](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref7).
- [8] [P.F. Ndione, A. Garcia, N.E. Widjonarko, A.K. Sigdel, K.X. Steirer, D.C. Olson,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref8) [P.A. Parilla, D.S. Ginley, N.R. Armstrong, R.E. Richards, E.L. Ratcliff, J.J. Berry,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref8) [Highly-tunable nickel cobalt oxide as a low-temperature P-type contact in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref8) [organic photovoltaic devices, Adv. Energy Mater. 3 \(2012\) 524.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref8)
- [9] [C.C. Mercado, A. Zakutayev, K. Zhu, C.J. Flynn, J.F. Cahoon, A.J. Nozik, Sensitized](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref9) [zinc cobalt oxide spinel P-type photoelectrode, J. Phys. Chem. C 118 \(2014\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref9) [25340.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref9)
- [10] [B. Chi, J. Li, X. Yang, H. Lin, N. Wang, Electrophoretic deposition of ZnCo2O4](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref10)

[spinel and its electrocatalytic properties for oxygen evolution reaction, Elec](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref10)trochim. Acta 50 (2005)  $2059 - 2064$ .

- [11] [M.R.G. De Chialvo, A.C. Chialvo, Oxygen evolution reaction on NixCo\(3-xO4](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref11) [electrodes with spinel structure, Electrochim. Acta 38 \(1993\) 2247](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref11)-[2252.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref11)
- [12] [P.F. Ndione, Y.Z. Shi, V. Stevanovic, A. Zakutayev, S. Lany, P.A. Parilla,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref12) [J.D. Perkins, J.J. Berry, D.S. Ginley, M.F. Toney, Control of the electrical prop](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref12)[erties in spinel oxides by manipulating the cation disorder, Adv. Funct. Mater.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref12) [24 \(2014\) 610.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref12)
- [13] [J.D. Perkins, T.R. Paudel, A. Zakutayev, P.F. Ndione, P.A. Parilla, D.L. Young,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref13) [S. Lany, D.S. Ginley, A. Zunger, N.H. Perry, Y. Tang, M. Grayson, T.O. Mason,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref13) [J.S. Bettinger, Y.Z. Shi, M.F. Toney, Inverse design approach to hole doping in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref13) [ternary oxides: enhancing p-type conductivity in cobalt oxide spinels, Phys.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref13) [Rev. B 84 \(2011\) 205207.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref13)
- [14] [T.R. Paudel, A. Zakutayev, S. Lany, M. d'Avezac, A. Zunger, Doping rules and](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref14) [doping protottype in A2BO4](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref14) [spinel oxides, Adv. Funct. Mater. 21 \(2011\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref14) [4493](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref14)-[4501](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref14).
- [15] [C.F. Windisch, G.J. Exarhos, R.R. Owings, Vibrational spectroscopic study of the](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref15) [site occupancy distribution of cations in nickel cobalt oxides, J. Appl. Phys. 95](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref15)  $(2004)$  5435-[5442.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref15)
- [16] [D.J. Hagen, T.S. Tripathi, M. Karppinen, Atomic layer deposition of nickel](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref16)cobalt spinel thin films, Dalton Trans.  $46$  (2017)  $4796-4805$  $4796-4805$ .
- [17] [R.R. Owings, G.J. Exarhos, C.F. Windisch, P.H. Holloway, J.G. Wen, Process](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref17) [enhanced polaron conductivity of infrared transparent nickel-cobalt oxide,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref17) Thin Solid Films  $483$  (2005)  $175-184$  $175-184$ .
- [18] [R.R. Owings, P.H. Holloway, G.J. Exarhos, C.F. Windisch, Effect of annealing and](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref18) [lithium substitution on conductivity in nickel-cobalt oxide spinel](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref18) films, Surf. [Interface Anal. 37 \(2005\) 424](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref18)–[431](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref18).<br>
[19] [A. Zakutayev, N.E. Widjonarko, J.D. Perkins, P.A. Parilla, J.J. Berry, D.S. Ginley,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref19)
- [Zn-Ni-Co-O wide-bandgap p-type conductive oxides with high work func](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref19)[tions, MRS Commun. 1 \(2011\) 23.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref19)
- [20] [W. Lan, W.L. Cao, M. Zhang, X.Q. Liu, Y.Y. Wang, E.Q. Xie, H. Yan, Annealing](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref20) [effect on the structural, optical, and electrical properties of CuAlO2](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref20) films [deposited by magnetron sputtering, J. Mater. Sci. 44 \(2009\) 1594](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref20)-[1599](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref20).
- [21] [T.W. Chiu, K. Tonooka, N. Kikuchi, Fabrication of ZnO and CuCrO\(2\): Mg thin](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref21) fi[lms by pulsed laser deposition with in situ laser annealing and its application](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref21) [to oxide diodes, Thin Solid Films 516 \(2008\) 5941](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref21)-[5947](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref21).
- [22] [A. Zakutayev, N. Wunder, M. Schwarting, J.D. Perkins, R. White, K. Munch,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref22) [W. Tumas, C. Phillips, An open experimental database for exploring inorganic](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref22) [materials, Sci. Data 5 \(2018\) 180053](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref22).
- [23] [H. Hosono, M. Yasukawa, H. Kawazoe, Novel oxide amorphous semi](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref23)[conductors: transparent conducting amorphous oxides, J. Non-Cryst. Solids](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref23) [203 \(1996\) 334](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref23)-[344.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref23)
- [24] [M.P. Taylor, D.W. Readey, M.F.A.M. Van Hest, C.W. Teplin, J.L. Alleman,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref24) [M.S. Dabney, L.M. Gedvilas, B.M. Keyes, B. To, J.D. Perkins, D.S. Ginley, The](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref24) [remarkable thermal stability of amorphous In-Zn-O transparent conductors,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref24) [Adv. Funct. Mater. 18 \(2008\) 3169](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref24)-[3178](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref24).
- [25] [J.D. Perkins, M.F.A.M. Van Hest, M.P. Taylor, D.S. Ginley, Conductivity and](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref25) [transparency in amorphous In-Zn-O transparent conductors, Int. J. Nano](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref25)[technol. 6 \(2009\) 850](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref25)-[859](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref25).
- [26] [R. Nagarajan, A.D. Draeseke, A.W. Sleight, J. Tate, p-type conductivity in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref26) CuCr1-xMgxO2 fi[lms and powders, J. Appl. Phys. 89 \(2001\) 8022](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref26)-[8025](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0925-8388(19)31957-7/sref26).