

## Impact of Siting Ordinances on Land Availability for Wind and Solar Development

Wesley Cole, Anthony Lopez, Brian Sergi, Aaron Levine, Jesse Carey, Cailee Mangan, Trieu Mai, Travis Williams, Pavlo Pinchuk, and Jianyu Gu National Renewable Energy Laboratory

## Why Siting Ordinances?



## Siting Ordinances Data Collection







## **Collection & Database Structure**

State-1	City/Towi-	Count	Feature Type	Value Type	Valu∉≖	Citation	Ŧ	Comment
Alabama		Baldwin	Banned			13.13		
Alabama		Cherokee	Property Line	Meters	782	Ala. Code § 45-10-260.05		
Alabama		Dekalb	Property Line	Meters	782	Ala. Code § 45-25-260.05		
Alabama		Etowah	Property Line	Meters	782	Ala. Code § 45-28-260.05		
Alabama		Cherokee	Sound	dBA	40	Ala. Code § 45-10-260.05		
Alabama		Dekalb	Sound	dBA	40	Ala. Code § 45-25-260.05		
Alabama		Etowah	Sound	dBA	40	Ala. Code § 45-28-260.05		
Alabama		Cherokee	Transmission	Max tip-height Multi	1.5	Ala. Code § 45-10-260.05		Minimum Setback of 1.5 the max height to an overhead electric line
Alabama		Dekalb	Transmission	Max tip-height Multi	1.5	Ala. Code § 45-25-260.05		
Alabama		Etowah	Transmission	Max tip-height Multi	1.5	Ala. Code § 45-28-260.05		§ 45-28-260.05
Arizona		Apache	Property Line	Max tip-height Multi	1.1	Apache County Art. 750		

A machine-readable database

State: The state in which the county is situated

City/Town: Used only where county level zoning was not present in a state

County: The county in which the ordinance was found

**Feature Type:** Describes the feature (e.g., road, structure, height) the restriction is applied to

**Value Type:** Describes the measure of the restriction (e.g., the restriction on maximum height is to be measured in meters)

Value: Describes the specific measurement of the value type of the restriction

Citation: The ordinance's legal citation

**Comment:** Brief annotations of the ordinance for clarity or for translation of a value (e.g., meters to feet)

## **Key Findings**

- 1,800+ ordinances (~300 in 2018) for wind and 800+ ordinances for solar in 2022
- Extrapolating setbacks throughout the country can reduce wind and solar resources by up to 87% and 38% (depending on the setback size).
- Results indicate the importance of capturing setback ordinances in resources assessments and modeling work.



Ordinana Tuna	Wind 0010	Wind 0000	Calas 000
Ordinance Type	Willa 2018	Wind 2022	50iar 202
Sructure Setback	95	378	136
Road Setback	62	355	142
Property Line Setback	6	359	234
Sound Restriction	51	224	36
Transmission Setback	42	183	0
Height Limit	12	91	190
Water Setback	7	66	11
Railroad Setback	9	61	1
Moratorium or Ban	2	56	4
Denisty Limit	0	35	5
Min/Max Lot Size	0	22	64
Shadow Flicker Limit	0	13	N/A
Total Installation Size	0	3	6
Coverage Limit	0	0	8
Maximum Project Size	0	2	2
Other	0	5	0
Total	286	1,853	839

## Setback Summaries

Wind (multiplier by tip height)					
Feature(s)	Counties	50%	90%		
Road, Transmission,	587	1.1	2		
Rail					
Property Line	350	1.1	3		
Structure	372	2	4		
Water	66	1.2	10.6		

PV (fixed meters)						
Feature(s)	Counties	50%	90%			
Road, Transmission,	140	30	76			
Rail						
Property Line	226	15	46			
Structure	135	61	152			
Water	11	30	76			

## Are Ordinances Becoming More Stringent?





### A Best-in-Class Model for Estimating Renewable Energy Supply



## Spatial Context Is a Driver of Impact

Maps are same size/scale and depict existing ordinances. Structures data from Microsoft Buildings dataset (https://github.com/microsoft/USBuildingFootprints)





Scale 1:500,000

## Scenarios

No Setbacks (Baseline)

Upper limit of technical potential. Only excludes areas that are legally or administratively protected + other unsuitable areas including water, infrastructure, mountainous landforms, etc.

Surveyed Setbacks

Baseline + existing setback ordinances

50<sup>th</sup> Percentile Setbacks

Baseline + existing setback ordinances + 50<sup>th</sup> percentile ordinances extrapolated to rest of the country 90<sup>th</sup> Percentile Setbacks

Baseline + existing setback ordinances + 90<sup>th</sup> percentile ordinances extrapolated to rest of the country

## Land Area and Capacity



INKEL | 11

## Area Impacts by County



## Links to Resources

- Website (includes interactive maps)
  - <u>https://www.nrel.gov/gis/renewable-energy-</u> <u>supply-curves.html</u>
- Data (download entire database for wind, solar)
  - Solar:

https://data.openei.org/submissions/5734

– Wind:

https://data.openei.org/submissions/5733

- **Tools** (NREL tools for spatially modeling the database)
  - reV: <u>https://github.com/NREL/reV</u>
  - reVx: <u>https://github.com/NREL/reVx</u>
- Paper
  - <u>https://www.nature.com/articles/s41560-023-01319-3</u>



Interactive map that includes the ability to hover and examine unique ordinances



- Siting ordinances are becoming increasingly common with a range of setback distances
- The setback distance can have a considerable impact on available resource
- Ordinances have a larger impact on wind resource than solar resource

## Follow-up: wesley.cole@nrel.gov

www.nrel.gov

This work was authored by the National Renewable Energy Laboratory, operated by Alliance for Sustainable Energy, LLC, for the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE) under Contract No. DE-AC36-08GO28308. This material is based upon work supported by the U.S. Department of Energy's Office of Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy (EERE) under the Solar Energy Technologies Office Award Number 38421. The views expressed in the article do not necessarily represent the views of the DOE or the U.S. Government. The U.S. Government retains and the publisher, by accepting the article for publication, acknowledges that the U.S. Government retains a nonexclusive, paid-up, irrevocable, worldwide license to publish or reproduce the published form of this work, or allow others to do so, for U.S. Government purposes.

# Transforming ENERGY

Photo from iStock-627281636

NREL/PR-6A40-87476

## **Spatial Siting Considerations**



Environmental

### Airspace

### Airport Setbacks (variable)

Intercontinental Ballistic Missiles ICBMs Risk of Adverse Impact on Military Operations and Readiness Area (RAIMORA) DoD Lands DoD Radar setbacks and line-of-site NEXRAD setbacks and line-of-site Military training routes

### winitary training routes

Special-use airspace

### Bat Hibernacula

### ANL BLM Wind Exclusions

Sage Grouse Core Habitat (federal land) T&E Species Core Habitat (subset) USFWS NWI American Farm Trust Conserved Farmlands

Nationally Significant Ag Lands

Big game migration corridors

Conservation Reserve Program (CRP)

Water, Woody/Herbaceous Wetlands Bureau of Land Management Areas of Critical Environmental Concern National Forest Service Inventoried Roadless Areas NCED GAP 1, 2 PAD-US GAP 1, 2 Slope Exclusion(s) Elevation & Mountainous Landforms

Oil & Gas Wells

Oil & Gas Pipelines (ROW) Water Setbacks Existing wind facilities Bans or Moratoriums Height Limits Rail Setbacks

Railroads

Transmission Setbacks Shadow Flicker **Sound Limits** Roads Structures

Social / Regulatory

Transmission (ROW)

Road Setbacks

Structure Setbacks

## **Gen-tie Impacts**



Available capacity (left axis) and land area (right axis) for solar (Figure A) and wind (Figure B) binned by gen-tie distance. The gen-tie line is the line that connects the site to the bulk power transmission infrastructure. The largest decreases in resource availability are those that are closest to the transmission infrastructure. Note the different y-axis scales.

## Capacity Factor of Remaining Resources



Weighted-average capacity factor for solar PV (A) and wind (B). Each figure shows the capacity factor and land area of all available capacity as well as for the top 1 TW of available capacity.

## **Challenges and Next Steps**

- Other types of ordinances are difficult to model yet could have large impacts.
  - Surrogate modeling (ML) to solve wind turbine sound modeling at national scales
- Collection of ordinances is labor intensive and ordinances change often, requiring frequent, unanticipated updates.
  - LLM's for semi-automated ordinance identification and extraction

### National Grid of Wind Speed is the Basis of Hypothetical Wind Turbine Locations

